

Pentahelix's Collaboration In The Development of Halal Tourism For Sustainable Regional Economic Development

Lukman Santoso¹, Yutisa Tri Cahyani²

^{1,2} Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ponorogo, Indonesia
Email: lukmansantoso4@gmail.com

Abstract:

The halal industry is a new sector of economic development in many countries. This includes halal tourism, which is also the mainstay of foreign exchange sources in the development of the service sector in Indonesia. This paper aims to explore the implementation the development of halal tourism in the region, as well as to design an ideal collaborative synergy model for the development of sustainable halal tourism. They use the qualitative methodology and a comparative approach to two halal tourism development areas, Malang city and Banyuwangi regency. This research discovered comparative advantages to implementing the pentahelix collaboration policy in establishing halal tourism in the two locations where there are variances and diversity in implementing the pentahelix collaboration in halal tourism. Each region has advantages that multi-sector and multi-stakeholder institutions complement. The development of halal tourism in Malang and Banyuwangi is further stymied by the absence of rules as a legal framework for development. However, the two regions are working to assure and expedite the development of halal tourism following local wisdom. This research helps to fill gaps in the development of halal tourism in Malang and Banyuwangi. Furthermore, this research contributes to the region's role as a paradigm for developing sustainable halal tourism.

Keywords: pentahelix collaboration; halal tourism; sustainable tourism

Abstrak:

Industri halal merupakan sektor baru pengembangan ekonomi di banyak negara. Termasuk dalam hal ini pariwisata halal yang juga menjadi andalan sumber devisa dalam pengembangan sektor jasa di Indonesia. Tulisan ini bertujuan untuk mengeksplorasi implementasi pengembangan pariwisata halal di daerah sekaligus merumuskan model ideal sinergitas kolaborasi pengembangan pariwisata halal berkelanjutan. Penelitian menggunakan metode kualitatif dan pendekatan komparatif terhadap dua daerah yang mengembangkan pariwisata halal, yaitu di Malang dan Banyuwangi. Penelitian ini menghasilkan temuan bahwa *comparative advantages* terhadap implemementasi kebijakan kolaborasi pentahelix dalam mengembangkan pariwisata halal di dua daerah tersebut terdapat variasi dan keragaman implementasi kolaborasi pentahelix pariwisata halal. Masing-masing daerah memiliki keunggulan yang ditopang oleh kelembagaan multi-sektor dan multi-stakeholders yang saling melengkapi. Pengembangan pariwisata halal Malang dan Banyuwangi juga masih menghadapi berbagai hambatan, terutama belum adanya regulasi sebagai payung hukum pengembangan. Tetapi kedua daerah tersebut berupaya memastikan sekaligus melakukan akselerasi bahwa pengembangan pariwisata halal tetap selaras dengan kearifan lokal. Kajian ini berkontribusi melengkapi kekurangan-kekurangan dari pengembangan pariwisata halal yang dimiliki Malang dan Banyuwangi. Selain itu kajian ini juga berkontribusi untuk dijadikan role model dalam pengembangan pariwisata halal berkelanjutan di daerah.

Kata Kunci: kolaborasi pentahelix; pariwisata halal; pariwisata berkelanjutan

Introduction

Recently, the Indonesian government has been aggressively developing the halal industry. President Joko Widodo (Jokowi) even targets Indonesia to become the centre of the world's halal industry by 2024.¹ As a country with the fourth largest population in the world, which is 267 million people, and with a Muslim majority population, the potential to become a market for Indonesia's halal industry is enormous, so it has potential as a producer, not only as a consumer. According to Pew Research Center's Religion & Public Life, the global Muslim population will exceed 1.9 billion by 2020. This figure is predicted to rise until it reaches 2.2 billion individuals, or 26.5% of the global population, in 2030.² Islamic Economy Report, 2020-2021, estimates that the world's Muslim population will spend more than \$2 trillion in the food, pharmaceutical, cosmetic, fashion, and leisure sectors.

The acceleration of the implementation of halal certification for micro and small business actors is one of the government's commitments to encourage the sustainable development of the halal industry in Indonesia. One of these projects is being carried out through *SEHATI* activities (Free Halal Certification) and the supply of halal facilitation for MSEs.³

This development demonstrates that Indonesia's Islamic economic and financial environment is strengthening for the country to become a global halal producer. Creating an integrated halal industrial ecosystem that includes all stakeholders is critical. With an excellent industrial environment, numerous halal industry problems and solutions can be mapped and used to accelerate Indonesia's recognition as a global producer of halal products.

Amid the rapid development of the halal business, Muslim-friendly tourism, or halal tourism, is emerging as a leading sector in several nations. The potential for Indonesia in this industry is likewise relatively high. According to The Global Travel Muslim Index (GMTI), after ranking fourth behind Saudi Arabia, Indonesia will move to second place behind Malaysia in 2022, ahead of 138 countries. The ranking as the best halal tourism destination in the world is based on variables such as accessibility, communication, environment, and service.⁴ Of these indicators, service indicators are important points because they relate to the availability of accommodation services, transportation, halal food, guarantees of healthy and hygienic food, worship facilities, and Islamic financial services that are friendly to Muslim tourists.⁵

This is relevant to the outcomes of the International Halal Congress, which will be held on June 14-15, 2022, in Bangka Belitung by the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI), which has agreed on nine (9) world halal resolutions. One of the critical issues is related to attempts to create halal tourism in Indonesia, specifically increasing the speed with which the halal industry and halal tourism are developed as an essential pillar of national and global

¹ Tim Detik, "Bisakah RI Jadi Pusat Industri Halal Dunia 2024?," accessed August 2, 2022, <https://finance.detik.com/>

² Rizky Alike, "Jokowi Targetkan RI Jadi Pusat Industri Halal Dunia Pada 2024," accessed August 2, 2022, <https://katadata.co.id/>

³ Dara Haspramudilla, "Siapa Jadi Pusat Halal Dunia, Ini Strategi Indonesia," *Media Keuangan*, accessed August 2, 2022, <https://mediakeuangan.kemenkeu.go.id/>

⁴ Diva Lufiana Putri, "Indonesia Peringkat Kedua Wisata Halal Dunia 2022," accessed August 2, 2022, <https://www.kompas.com/>

⁵ Kuat Ismanto, "Pengelolaan Pariwisata Halal Pekalongan Studi Peran Pedagang Kuliner Dan Kesejahteraan Masyarakat," *IQTISHADIA Jurnal Ekonomi & Perbankan Syariah* 7, no. 2 (November 16, 2020): 138-55, <https://doi.org/10.19105/iqtishadia.v7i2.3522>.

economic growth following the pandemic.⁶ The government expects the tourist industry to become the primary foreign exchange source, stimulate investment, and absorb labour.⁷

However, even though Indonesia has enormous potential for halal tourism, the development of halal tourism in various regions continues to raise pros, cons, and even resistance. For example, consider what occurred in Bali, Lake Toba, Toraja, and Labuan Bajo. This issue arose because, in addition to a lack of synergy and coordination among halal tourism stakeholders,⁸ halal tourism is still widely known by the general public. Some see halal tourism as the Islamization of tourism, while others are more moderate and inclusive, yet others are more pragmatic and capitalistic. The development of halal tourism is still limited to branding, with no impact on people's welfare or acceleration of economic growth.⁹ According to Umiyati and Tamrin, halal tourism is not yet optimal as the primary provider of foreign exchange and economic acceleration due to a lack of coordination and synergy among numerous stakeholders.¹⁰

This issue is relevant to studies on tourism development and governance written by several researchers, such as Qodriyatun,¹¹ Bichler & Losch,¹² Nainggolan et al.,¹³ Wahida et al.,¹⁴ Santoso & Djumiarti,¹⁵ and Mulyani.¹⁶

According to Qodriyatun's research, tourism development policies in small islands around Karimunjawa are not sustainable. Although it has created new jobs and boosted

⁶ Redaksi, "Kongres Halal Internasional 2022 Cetuskan 9 Butir Resolusi Halal Dunia," *Majelis Ulama Indonesia*, accessed August 2, 2022, <https://mui.or.id/>

⁷ Hanni Sofia, "Pariwisata Diproyeksikan Jadi Penyumbang Devisa Terbesar," April 20, 2020, <https://www.antaranews.com/berita/1114530/>; Janianton Damanik, *Pariwisata Indonesia: Antara Peluang Dan Tantangan* (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2017).

⁸ Lukman Santoso, Agus Triyanta, and Jawahir Thontowi, "Halal Tourism Regulations in Indonesia: Trends and Dynamics in the Digital Era," *Ijtihad: Jurnal Wacana Hukum Islam dan Kemanusiaan* 22, no. 1 (August 1, 2022): 73–94.

⁹ Lukman Santoso, Yutisa Tri Cahyani, and Suryani Suryani, "Dilema Kebijakan Wisata Halal Di Pulau Lombok," *Jurnal Sosiologi Reflektif* 15, no. 1 (November 9, 2020): 23–44, <https://doi.org/10.14421/jsr.v15i1.1968>; Marina Ramadhani, "Dilema Regulasi Pariwisata Halal Di Indonesia," *Ar Rehla: Journal of Islamic Tourism, Halal Food, Islamic Traveling, and Creative Economy* 1, no. 1 (April 27, 2021): 89–105, <https://doi.org/10.21274/ar-rehla.2021.1.1.89-105>.

¹⁰ Sri Umiyati and M. Husni Tamrin, "Penta Helix Synergy in Halal Tourism Development" (Atlantis Press, 2021), 75–81, <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210120.108>.

¹¹ Sri Nurhayati Qodriyatun, "Implementasi Kebijakan Pengembangan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan di Karimunjawa," *Aspirasi: Jurnal Masalah-masalah Sosial* 9, no. 2 (March 26, 2019): 240–59, <https://doi.org/10.46807/aspirasi.v9i2.1110>.

¹² Bernhard Fabian Bichler and Magdalena Lösch, "Collaborative Governance in Tourism: Empirical Insights into a Community-Oriented Destination," *Sustainability* 11, no. 23 (2019): 1–19.

¹³ Mangido Nainggolan et al., "Pentahelix Model Application for Tourism Development Strategy," *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Culture* 6, no. 2 (March 2, 2020): 12–18, <https://doi.org/10.21744/ijllc.v6n2.864>.

¹⁴ Siti Nurul Wahida, Yana Syafriyana, and Oman Sukmana, "Collaboration with Pentahelix Model in Developing Kajoetangan Heritage Tourism in Malang City," *Journal of Local Government Issues (LOGOS)* 3, no. 1 (March 30, 2020): 1–17, <https://doi.org/10.22219/logos.v3i1.10699>.

¹⁵ R. Slamet Santoso and Titik Djumiarti, "Collaborative Governance in Tourism Development at the Protected Area Sangiran Indonesia" (Atlantis Press, 2020), 351–55, <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.201219.053>.

¹⁶ Sri Mulyani, Retno Dewi Pramodia Ahsani, and Daya Negri Wijaya, "Collaborative Governance on Ecotourism: Towards Sustainable Tourism Development," *Jurnal Borneo Administrator* 17, no. 3 (December 28, 2021): 319–34, <https://doi.org/10.24258/jba.v17i3.958>.

people's income, it has also changed society's values and caused environmental damage. As a result, he believes that an integrated plan involving various sectors and stakeholders is required. Particularly in spatial planning, he carried out capacity calculation, AMDAL investigations, and environmentally sustainable use of natural resources.

Bichler and Lösch's research in South Tyrol, Italy, showed that tourism destination leadership is an essential driver of Collaborative Governance (CG). However, several CG issues have emerged. First, institutional transformation causes distrust and heightened insecurity. Second, prominent actors such as citizens are still underrepresented in the decision-making and implementation stages. Third, the stakeholders' vision does not yet include a shared vision of the future growth of tourist sites.

Meanwhile, in their research, Nainggolan et al. stated that the lack of synergy between stakeholders caused the low number of tourist visits to Toba Samosir. The local government considers that stakeholders are the sole owners of power, so tourism development has not been able to produce prosperity and even tends to cause prolonged conflicts in the community.

Wahida et al.'s research is also worth considering. The study is about developing Kampong Heritage Kajoetangan as a tourist attraction in Malang. This study emphasizes that the primary reason for Kampong Heritage Kajoetangan Tourism's ineffective management is a lack of accessibility, facilities, and infrastructure development. Even though stakeholder engagement has increased the promotion of the Kajoetangan Heritage, this collaboration has not been able to provide a possible contribution to regional income. This occurs due to the inability of the parties concerned to resolve the issue of accessibility, amenities, and infrastructure.

Furthermore, in their research in the Sangiran protected area, Sragen, Santoso, and Djumiarti claimed that the balancing position in collaborative governance does not appear to be working well. It emerges merely as a complement, with no private role in the partnership. The performers' relationship has not been created following the desired goal. Furthermore, the collaboration between partners generates a schism with the destination's indigenous Javanese cultural conservationists.

Mulyani et al. discovered a similar fact in their research in Magelang, stating that the engagement of government actors in the development of ecotourism was still quite restricted. The response has been quite gradual, with the community still waiting for the creation of independent destinations. Meanwhile, local communities and the business/private sector are heavily involved. As a result, in the future, it will be required to increase stakeholder participation to ensure successful natural resource management in ecotourism.

Furthermore, studies surrounding the tourism pentahelix collaboration, such as Putro and Briliayanti's research,¹⁷ on the effectiveness of applying the Destination Management Organization (DMO) concept in improving the weaknesses of tourism management in Pangandaran, are interesting to compare. This notion stresses the type of collaboration between tourist stakeholders from community groups, the commercial sector, and the government. These stakeholders are led by the Tourism Governance Forum (FTKP), a destination management organization that serves as a mediator, facilitator, and coordinator for the three stakeholder groups.

¹⁷ Heru Purboyo Hidayat Putro and Astri Briliayanti, "The Effectivity of Stakeholders' Collaboration on Tourism Destination Governance in Pangandaran, West Java, Indonesia," *ASEAN Journal on Hospitality and Tourism* 17, no. 1 (June 15, 2019): 25-37, <https://doi.org/10.5614/ajht.2019.17.1.3>.

Another study by Ahman Sya et al. claimed that pentahelix collaboration is essential in managing sustainable tourism locations. Human resource development (HRD) has not met the minimum competency certification requirements in the Tanjung Lesung tourism destination context. To accelerate the development and improvement of the Tanjung Lesung destination, a new model of sustainable community-based tourism with pro-job, pro-poor, pro-growth, and pro-environment policies must be implemented.¹⁸

Unlike the previous research, this study will take a unique perspective on exploring the halal tourist collaboration policy in Malang and Banyuwangi, East Java, as a role model in establishing sustainable collaborative halal tourism. This study will focus to explore the implementation the development of halal tourism in Malang and Banyuwangi and then formulate the ideal model collaborative for sustainable halal tourism development so that it can be applied more dynamically in developing halal tourism in various regions in Indonesia to strengthen the novelty aspect of this study.

Research Method

This study uses a qualitative method with the type of literature study. The data in this study were obtained from various sources related to halal tourism, printed and electronic documents, with a snowball sampling pattern. This qualitative study was conducted in Malang city and Banyuwangi regency, East Java, utilizing a conceptual and comparative method. Data was gathered from various legal sources, scientific research, and policies report. Meanwhile, data analysis was conducted through data reduction, presentation, interpretation, and conclusion.

Conception and Urgency of Halal Tourism Pentahelix Collaboration

Collaboration is an effort by multiple people to attain a common goal.¹⁹ According to Ansell and Gash, collaboration is implemented in the framework of Collaborative Governance through government arrangements in which one or more public institutions actively incorporate non-State stakeholders in a deliberative and collaborative decision-making process. The goal of this government partnership is to develop or implement public policies as well as manage government initiatives.

The Collaborative Governance model comprises four variables: a) The initial conditions of collaboration are influenced by numerous phenomena, one of which is that the stakeholders share a shared interest and goal to achieve. b) Institutional design relates to how the game rules are formulated when cooperating; this is critical since it creates procedural legitimacy in the cooperation process. c) Leadership includes deliberation by stakeholders, setting clear basic rules, creating trust, encouraging dialogue among stakeholders, and sharing mutual advantages.²⁰

Collaboration can be achieved by involving two or more stakeholders to achieve the desired goals collaboratively. Similarly, halal tourism will not materialize and expand sustainably if it solely depends on the government. Thus, it takes many parties from diverse

¹⁸ Ahman Sya et al., "Pengelolaan Destinasi Pariwisata Berkelanjutan: Kasus Tanjung Lesung Provinsi Banten," *Jurnal Geografi, Edukasi Dan Lingkungan (JGEL)* 5, no. 1 (January 29, 2021): 27–32, <https://doi.org/10.22236/jgel.v5i1.5311>.

¹⁹ Sri Umiyati and M. Husni Tamrin, *Pengembangan Wisata Halal, Tanggung Jawab Siapa? Studi Kasus Kolaborasi Stakeholder Halal Tourism Di Kota Malang* (Jakarta: Penerbit Akses, 2020).

²⁰ C. Ansell and A. Gash, "Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice," *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 18, no. 4 (October 17, 2007): 543–71, <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>.

disciplines and sectors to collaborate, such as the public, legislators, corporations, culturalists, artists, information technology activists, and the digital community. A creative partnership is essential to materialize to support one another and use the parties' experience and advantages to develop innovative ideas.²¹

Meanwhile, the pentahelix concept can be interpreted as five development ties consisting of government, business, community, academic, and media publications, also known as BGCAM as a tourist system driver. The strength of all of these aspects is required to support the development of halal tourism. The primary factors to the success of halal tourism development are commitment and synergy between one aspect and another in the pentahelix.²²

Arief Yahya (Minister of Tourists of the Republic of Indonesia 2014-2019) introduced the pentahelix model in the tourism industry for the first time in Indonesia, as stated in Minister of Tourism Regulation Number 14 of 2016 concerning Guidelines for Sustainable Tourism Destinations. This law aims to orchestrate and ensure the quality of activities, facilities, and services and generate experiences and values of tourist advantages to benefit the community and the environment.²³

Using the pentahelix model is critical for ensuring the effectiveness of halal tourism development rules. The pentahelix collaboration aims to innovate while contributing to regional socioeconomic improvement. Each element of the pentahelix is described below in the context of establishing halal tourism.

First and foremost, the government (regulator). The government is a bureaucracy viewed as the most accountable administrative agent in implementing regional policies. The government has "political power" to develop policy through halal tourism decisions. As a regulator, local governments must facilitate the development of halal tourism through policies that are easily implemented and capable of supporting all stakeholders in the tourism sector, such as providing intensive facilities or tax breaks, mainly for several sectors experiencing sluggish economic conditions as a result of the pandemic, such as hotels, restaurants, and tourism events.

The Tourism Office is the spearhead, then supported by the Trade and Industry Office, which supports the circulation of halal products, the Cooperatives, and UMKM Service, which oversees certification and marketing. The Health Service oversees the health aspect of the product. The Transportation Service supports transportation, the Public Works and Spatial Planning Service contribute to the determination of areas and destinations as well as infrastructure, the Civil Service Police Unit (Pol PP), the Ministry of Religion and the DPRD, as well as all parties who control government authority must synergize and collaborate to generate and accelerate the development of halal tourism in post-pandemic areas.

Second, private/business (enabler). The business and entrepreneur/private sectors are sectors that can be further optimized to accelerate the halal tourism industry, such as aspects of profit, people, sustainability, and development. It is also necessary to instil in business

²¹ Abdullah Azwar Anas, *Creative Collaboration: 10 Tahun Perjalanan Transformasi Banyuwangi* (Jakarta: Expose, 2020), 136.

²² Sri Umiyati and M. Husni Tamrin, "Pentahelix Synergy in Halal Tourism Development" (Presented at the 4th International Conference on Sustainable Innovation 2020–Social, Humanity, and Education (ICoSIHESS 2020), Atlantis Press, 2021), 75–81, accessed February 20, 2022, <https://www.atlantispress.com/proceedings/icosihess-20/125951432>.

²³ Tri Yuningsih, Titi Darmi, and Susi Sulandari, "Model Pentahelik Dalam Pengembangan Pariwisata Di Kota Semarang," *JPSI (Journal of Public Sector Innovations)* 3, no. 2 (May 31, 2019): 84–93, <https://doi.org/10.26740/jpsi.v3n2.p84-93>.

people a sense of local wisdom and the spirit of Pancasila so that they have the spirit of sustainable development and concern for social justice. Because it is feared that if tourism development is not accompanied by a perspective of local wisdom and founded on Pancasila, 'new capitalists' will emerge who exploit local wealth without ethics and do not care about the religious values of the local community or social justice in society. Several business sectors are spearheading halal tourism in the region, for example, the Indonesian Hotel and Restaurant Association (PHRI), the Association of the Indonesian Tours and Travel Agencies (ASITA), the Indonesian Tour Guide Association (HPI), the Home Culinary Association, MSMEs, young entrepreneurs, and others.

The Tourism Awareness Group (Pokdarwis), the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI), Nahdlatul Ulama (NU), Muhammadiyah, Osing Customary Institutions, Arts Council, humanists, NGOs, Blogger Community, Photography Community, Generation Pesona Indonesia (Genpi), Hijaber Community, Hijrah Community, Netizen Community, Millennial Generation Community, and others play a role here. This is where they may actively participate in creating halal tourism—involving all levels of society in socializing and civilizing halal tourist policies.

Fourth, educational institutions/academics (conceptors). Academics and educational institutions are employed in secondary and higher education institutions and are heavily involved in tourism research and development. Academics, namely universities and research institutes, are critical in building a knowledge-based society. It is intended that through its "knowledge power," it will present knowledge that can be realized in more pro-community and environmental projects. Academic capacity plays a role in moulding society by providing the necessary skilled workforce, allowing economic knowledge to grow. Academics' roles in these educational institutions might range from developing legislation to reviewing its execution to ensure they continue to benefit the community.

There are several educational institutions and academics in the area, such as Madrasah Aliyah, SMA, SMK, Universities (PT), Religious Institutions (PTKI), and others. In supporting halal tourism, it can also be optimized for *ma'had aly* in Islamic boarding schools or universities located in Islamic boarding schools in Malang and Banyuwangi.

Fifth, media/publication (catalyst). The media has a role as a means of socialization, policy communication and an essential link between government and society. The role of the media has its place in the policy implementation process to provide space for the government and society to harmonize understanding related to halal tourism regulations. There are mainstream media and community media that can be empowered. Such as radio, TV, newspapers, online media, digital media, social media, blogs, and YouTube.

The central role of the media, mainly digital, which in the era of the pandemic is quite massive, needs to be optimized in promoting halal tourism. The media must be able to explore exotic tourist objects and be friendly and comfortable to visit. Innovation and creativity are the keywords in media involvement in collaboration to develop the halal tourism industry.

Based on the description of the pentahelix development concept, the synergy and collaboration of all parties, especially the tourism pentahelix element, is a necessity that must be carried out as a manifestation of the successful revival of post-pandemic halal tourism in the region. In today's digital era, the power of tourism development must be supported by all

stakeholders because the acceleration of development will not be achieved merely by government performance without cooperation with various parties.²⁴

Figure 1. Halal tourism Pentahelix Collaborative Model



Regarding the illustration in Figure 1. above, multi-sectoral synergy and collaboration in the implementation of halal tourism are significant and fundamental. So far, the government still looks dominant in initiating the development of halal tourism destinations. The community is still not well coordinated, the business sector and the tourism industry are not independent, academics still pay little attention to tourism issues, and the media have not maximized their efforts in promoting halal tourism in the region. Therefore, adopting the concept of pentahelix collaboration is necessary for developing sustainable halal tourism. This collaboration also needs to be realized on an ongoing basis, starting from policy formulation, policy implementation, and policy monitoring to policy evaluation.

Collaborative Halal Tourism Development: Insight from Malang and Banyuwangi

Malang and Banyuwangi are two areas in East Java (East Java) which are massively developing halal tourism. The two areas also have the potential for cultural diversity, pilgrimage tourism, historical tourism and natural tourism that are attractive to tourists. Tourism is one of the leading sectors in the two regions in supporting regional economic growth. As an area in East Java Province, it is a strategic area for developing national tourism because it is on the national tourism travel route.²⁵ Moreover, the Ministry of Tourism has determined East Java to be one of the 10 provinces as Indonesia's leading halal tourist destination. The determination of the 10 provinces is one of the government's strategic steps through the Ministry of Tourism in accelerating Indonesia to become the mecca of world halal

²⁴ Edoardus E. Maturbongs and Ransta L. Lekatompessy, "Kolaborasi Pentahelix Dalam Pengembangan Pariwisata Berbasis Kearifan Lokal Di Kabupaten Merauke," *Transparansi: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Administrasi* 3, no. 1 (June 30, 2020): 55–63.

²⁵ Mutimmatul Faidah & Moch. Khoirul Anwar, *Potensi Pariwisata Syariah di Jawa Timur*, (Surabaya, t.p, 2016).

tourism. In addition, East Java has the potential for foreign tourist visits because there are several representatives of foreign countries consisting of consulate generals, consulates, and special representative offices, which are all based in Surabaya.

Every year the number of domestic and foreign tourist visits continues to increase from 2012 to 2019. Based on data from the BPS of East Java Province, the contribution of tourism to the regional economy has also increased. In 2012, tourism GRDP reached Rp75.61 trillion, which increased in 2013 and 2014 to Rp88.16 trillion and Rp101.9 trillion, respectively. In 2016, it increased to Rp106.27 trillion.

The following factors support the development of East Java halal tourism: *First*, the dominance of the Muslim population in East Java; *Second*, cultural diversity, where East Java Province is known as an area that is thick with Islamic culture, in addition to the historical heritage of the development of Nusantara Islam which was centred in East Java during the Wali Songo era, *Third*, the existence of religious tourism objects ranging from historic mosque buildings, pilgrimage sites for propagating figures. in Java, Islamic boarding schools that are hundreds of years old, as well as natural attractions such as beaches, mountains, waterfalls, as well as holding cultural festivals, *Fourth*, accommodation and other services needed by tourists such as hotels, restaurants or restaurants that have been certified halal and the availability of Islamic financial institutions and adequate Islamic hospitals²⁶

Malang City and Banyuwangi Regency have been developing halal tourism since 2017. At the beginning of 2017, Malang City Tourism Office intensively conducted socialization with tourism industry players in Malang City 165 about halal tourism.²⁷ The development of halal tourism in Malang is also carried out by accelerating halal certification for restaurants, business actors, hotel services, and collaboration with Halal Centers at various campuses in Malang.²⁸ Development of halal tourism destinations in Malang, ranging from urban tourism, nature, history, and education to Islamic boarding schools.²⁹

Meanwhile, the focus on developing halal tourism in Banyuwangi Regency started in 2017 with the inauguration of Santen beach as a sharia beach.³⁰ The seriousness of the Banyuwangi Government is based on a complete halal tourist destination, ranging from urban tourism, family tourism, nature tourism (Meeting, Incentive, Convention, Exhibition; MICE), religious tourism, conservation tourism, beach tourism, history and culinary.³¹

The East Java Regional Regulation No. 6 of 2017 concerning the Master Plan for Tourism Development (RIPPARDA) of East Java Province for 2017-2032 is not explained in detail the development of halal tourism as a segment of East Java tourism, especially Malang and Banyuwangi. Halal tourism has become one of the segments that have emerged in the

²⁶ Muhammad Mufli, "East Java Halal Tourism Outlook: Potential Analysis and Strategy for East Java Halal Tourism Development," *East Java Economic Journal* 2, no. 2 (August 5, 2018): 187–209.

²⁷ Mochamad Novi Rifa'i, "Integrasi Pariwisata Halal Di Kota Malang," *Falah: Jurnal Ekonomi Syariah* 4, no. 2 (2019): 194–201.

²⁸ Sri Umiyati & M. Husni Tamin, *Pengembangan Wisata Halal, Tanggung Jawab Siapa? Studi Kasus Kolaborasi Stakeholders Halal Tourism di Kota Malang*, (Jakarta: Penerbit Akses, 2020)

²⁹ Abdul Muntholib, "Strategi Pengelolaan Wisata Halal pada Pondok Pesantren," *Jihbiz: Journal of Islamic Economy, Finance, and Banking* 4, no. 1 (January 25, 2020): 1–19.

³⁰ Ilham Mashuri, "Implementation of Sharia Compliance in The Halal Tourism Industry In Indonesia (A Study on Sharia Hotels and Beaches)," *Prophetic Law Review* 2, no. 2 (December 28, 2020): 200–220, <https://doi.org/10.20885/PLR.vol2.iss2.art5>.

³¹ Abdullah Azwar Anas, *Creattive Collaboration: 10 Tahun Perjalanan Transformasi Banyuwangi*, (Bandung: Mizan, 2020) 168-169

Provincial Tourism Destination (DPP) development plan for Madura and surrounding areas.³² This is adjusted to the social conditions of the Madurese religious community, where 90% of the population on Madura Island embraces Islam. The potential for developing halal tourism on Madura Island can also be seen from the acculturation of local culture, which has been influenced by the teachings of Islam and the existence of religious tourism objects such as mosques and sultanate palaces on Madura Island.

However, in its development, Madura Island has not maximally developed halal tourism. It is precisely Malang and Banyuwangi 2017 that have caught the opportunity of this halal tourism trend.³³ This is one of the issues that must be overcome in the future by revising the RIPPARDA of East Java province.

Nowadays, the development of the Halal Industrial Park area in Sidoarjo has begun. The East Java government also needs to formulate a grand design for developing East Java halal tourism synergistic with developing coastal areas to become a halal tourism village. As stated by the Governor of East Java, Khofifah Indar Parawansa, there are 8 501 villages/urban villages in East Java, so if half of them have a halal tourism village area, there must be employed. In addition, the existence of BUMDes can help manage the village economy to improve the community's economy. The key to the sustainability of coastal ecosystems is good management by all elements of society.³⁴

Sustainable East Java halal tourism development can ideally be used as a strategy in making the tourism sector the engine of the East Java economy. However, a note is that the development of East Java halal tourism is not limited to incidental and ceremonial policies. However, it needs to be equipped with comprehensive regulations and policies.

Currently, the development of halal tourism in Malang and Banyuwangi still faces several obstacles, namely: not yet supported by special regulations, road maps or grand designs that have not been formulated, RIPPARDA has not been synergized with related regulations, synergy and collaboration between stakeholders are not evenly distributed and balanced, and accelerated halal certification. In the tourism business sector, which is still minimal, the multi-platform development of the East Java halal tourism information centre based on LoT is not yet massive, and the lack of memorable branding for East Java halal tourism.

Improvements and improvements in these various sectors are expected to optimize the potential and development of halal tourism in East Java to become one of Indonesia's leading halal tourism destinations.

Based on this fact, it can be underlined that each region has advantages and disadvantages. So the pentahelix collaboration becomes a pivotal solution to complement each other. However, what can be a role model for the development of halal tourism in Malang and Banyuwangi is that there is a spirit of pentahelix collaboration and creative collaboration that is used as the basis for developing halal tourism. Therefore, efforts to explore the advantages of each region as a comparative advantage are essential in developing a collaborative pentahelix of halal tourism based on the characteristics of each regional

³² Regional Regulation No. 6 of 2017 concerning the Master Plan for Tourism Development of East Java Province for 2017–2032 and its explanation

³³ Peni Widarti, "Menyingkap Potensi Besar Pariwisata Halal di Jawa Timur" <https://bisnisindonesia.id/article/> accessed September 27, 2021.

³⁴ Lukman Hakim dengan judul "Gubernur Khofifah Siapkan Kawasan Pesisir Jadi Desa Wisata Halal", dalam <https://daerah.sindonews.com/> accessed Desember 12, 2021

stakeholder. Such as Malang and Banyuwangi have advantages in the aspect of collaboration and innovation in multi-platform tourism based on IoT.

So, based on the description of the comparative advantage, in the context of halal tourism in the era of regional autonomy, at the level of implementation, the concept of halal tourism can adapt and be combined with the characteristics of each region. However, in its implementation, it will undoubtedly be faced with political dynamics in each region. Both from internal local government and external. This means that any model of halal tourism development, especially in policy and formulation of regulations, will undoubtedly face different challenges. So that the pentahelix collaboration pattern also goes hand in hand with the socio-politics of each region. As argued by R. Michael Feener, "...the reconstruction of Islam and society in Indonesia thus remains very much an unfinished project."³⁵

Thus, it is crucial to change the paradigm of post-pandemic tourism development. So far, the tourism development paradigm still refers to the modernization and economic growth model. Modernization tends to sacrifice and burden future generations by polluting the environment and destroying ecosystems threatening natural resources.³⁶ In this regard, Stiglitz believes that the government must actively promote development and protect the poor.³⁷

Furthermore, Riyanto Sofyan asserted that the Covid-19 pandemic period formed a global tourism megatrend with characteristics to humanize humans (humanization), namely caring for the environment and tourism that prioritizes human health. This is in line with halal tourism, which has a foothold in maintaining the ethics of hospitality, prioritizing health, caring for the environment, promoting local wisdom, and running sustainable tourism.³⁸

The halal concept prioritizes health and safety in line with the CHSE (Cleanliness, Health, safety, environmental sustainability) protocol, which the government prepared to revive and increase tourist confidence in national tourism. Thus, the *new normal* pattern and travel style in the current era are part of halal tourism's substance.³⁹

Halal tourism policy is a multi-sectoral as well as multi-regional policy. So that a sustainable and integrated halal tourism policy formulation is needed. Therefore, the formulation of the sustainable halal tourism pentahelix collaboration is tourism that is increasingly preserved, prosperous, and beneficial for many people. As the core teaching of

³⁵ R. Michael Feener, "Social Engineering Through Shari'a: Islamic Law and State-Directed Da'wa in Contemporary Aceh," *Indonesia Law Review* 3, no. 3 (September 1, 2014): 285, <https://doi.org/10.15742/ilrev.v3n3.42>.

³⁶ M. Dawam Rahardjo, *Pembangunan Pascamodernis: Esai-Esai Politik* (Yogyakarta: Insist Press, 2012); Lukman Santoso and Yutisa Tri Cahyani, "Pengaturan Wisata Halal Untuk Pembangunan Daerah: Transformasi Industri Halal Di Era Disrupsi," *Supremasi Hukum: Jurnal Kajian Ilmu Hukum* 9, no. 1 (July 9, 2020): 57-75.

³⁷ Joseph E. Stiglitz, *Making Globalization Work* (WW Norton & Company, 2007).

³⁸ Lihat Redaksi HAI, "Prinsip Wisata Halal Sejalan Dengan Megatren Wisata Global," Desember 2020, <https://www.harianaceh.co.id/>; Also see Hatem El-Gohary, "Coronavirus and Halal Tourism and Hospitality Industry: Is It a Journey to the Unknown?," *Sustainability* 12, no. 21 (2020): 1-26.

³⁹ Redaksi, "Wisata Halal, 'Vaksin' Pariwisata Di Masa Pandemi Covid-19," accessed Desember 2020, <https://diskominformatik.ntbprov.go.id/>; Kasmarini Baharuddin et al., "Understanding the Halal Concept and the Importance of Information on Halal Food Business Needed by Potential Malaysian Entrepreneurs," *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences* 5, no. 2 (2015): 170-80.

utilitarianism, the legal policy aims to provide the most significant benefit and happiness to as many people as possible.⁴⁰

Realizing sustainable halal tourism requires an integrated pentahelix collaboration involving various sectors and stakeholders. The collaboration must start with spatial planning, calculation of carrying capacity (ecological carrying capacity, physical carrying capacity, and social carrying capacity), AMDAL studies, use of natural resources in an environmentally friendly manner, as well as the roles and responsibilities of each stakeholder involved in the halal tourism development.⁴¹

Following Mulyani et al., stakeholders must collaborate to develop sustainable tourism. The expected achievements at least comprehensively regulate natural destinations responsible for the sustainability of life, economic activities, and the welfare of the community simultaneously.⁴² This halal tourism role model can be developed by implementing it in ecotourism or local wisdom-based tourism villages such as Bali.⁴³

Developing it through rural tourism can at least contribute to reducing the exodus of people from villages to cities, creating jobs, and promoting the socio-economic development of rural areas. So indirectly, it also helps preserve nature, traditions, culture and particular regional institutions.⁴⁴

Amid the diversity of society, halal tourism must indeed be present as an inclusive tourism segment. Collaboratively managed and become a means of realizing social justice for all levels of society. Halal tourism policies must belong to all humans, regardless of religion. Become tourism that protects, supports, serves, and protects all. This is also an essential idea in the International Halal Congress in Bangka Belitung, through one of the world's halal resolutions. Namely by encouraging the acceleration of the development of Halal Tourism by maintaining inclusiveness as a mainstream tourist destination for various tourists through strategic and comprehensive actions by tourism pentahelix to create sustainable halal tourism nationally and globally.

Conclusion

Dealing with the discussion of the various sub-chapters of this study, it could be concluded that, First, there are many variations of collaboration in the implementation of the halal tourism pentahelix. The pentahelix collaboration policy in developing halal tourism in the cities of Malang and Banyuwangi had its respective advantages, which complementary multi-sector and multi-stakeholder institutions supported. Second, the development of halal tourism in Malang and Banyuwangi still faced various obstacles, especially with no comprehensive regulations on a policy basis. Even though there is an obstacle, both regions try to assure at once conduct acceleration that halal tourism development needs to be in line with local wisdom until the synergy and idea of sustainable development can be manifested.

⁴⁰ Anang Sutono et al., "The Implementation of Halal Tourism Ecosystem Model in Borobudur Temple as Tourism Area," *Indonesian Journal of Halal Research (IJHAR)* 3, no. 1 (February 28, 2021): 13–20, <https://doi.org/10.15575/ijhar.v3i1.11119>.

⁴¹ Qodriyatun, "Implementasi Kebijakan Pengembangan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan di Karimunjawa."

⁴² Mulyani, Ahsani, and Wijaya, "Collaborative Governance on Ecotourism."

⁴³ Khusnul Rofida Novianti, "Maximizing Bali Village Tourism Potential Using Penta-Helix Model," *International Journal of Social Science and Business* 5, no. 1 (March 15, 2021): 86–92, <https://doi.org/10.23887/ijssb.v5i1.30650>.

⁴⁴ Harne Julianti Tou, Melinda Noer, and Sari Lenggogeni, "Pengembangan Desa Wisata Yang Berkearifan Lokal Sebagai Bentuk Pembangunan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan," *Jurnal Rekayasa* 10, no. 2 (December 10, 2020): 95–101.

REFERENCES

- Alika, Rizky. "Jokowi Targetkan RI Jadi Pusat Industri Halal Dunia Pada 2024," Oktober 2021. <https://katadata.co.id/ameidyonasution/berita/6170fad8b12e3/jokowi-targetkan-ri-jadi-pusat-industri-halal-dunia-pada-2024>.
- Anas, Abdullah Azwar. *Creative Collaboration: 10 Tahun Perjalanan Transformasi Banyuwangi*. Jakarta: Expose, 2020.
- Ansell, C., and A. Gash. "Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice." *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* 18, no. 4 (October 17, 2007): 543–71. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>.
- Baharuddin, Kasmarini, Norliya Ahmad Kassim, Siti Khairiyah Nordin, and Siti Zahrah Buyong. "Understanding the Halal Concept and the Importance of Information on Halal Food Business Needed by Potential Malaysian Entrepreneurs." *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences* 5, no. 2 (2015): 170–80.
- Bichler, Bernhard Fabian, and Magdalena Lösch. "Collaborative Governance in Tourism: Empirical Insights into a Community-Oriented Destination." *Sustainability* 11, no. 23 (2019): 1–19.
- Damanik, Janianton. *Pariwisata Indonesia: Antara Peluang Dan Tantangan*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2017.
- El-Gohary, Hatem. "Coronavirus and Halal Tourism and Hospitality Industry: Is It a Journey to the Unknown?" *Sustainability* 12, no. 21 (2020): 1–26.
- Feener, R. Michael. "Social Engineering Through Shari'a: Islamic Law and State-Directed Da'wa in Contemporary Aceh." *Indonesia Law Review* 3, no. 3 (September 1, 2014): 285. <https://doi.org/10.15742/ilrev.v3n3.42>.
- Haspramudilla, Dara. "Siap Jadi Pusat Halal Dunia, Ini Strategi Indonesia." *Media Keuangan*, February 1, 2022. <https://mediakeuangan.kemenkeu.go.id/article/show/siap-jadi-pusat-halal-dunia-ini-strategi-indonesia>.
- Ismanto, Kuart. "Pengelolaan Pariwisata Halal Pekalongan Studi Peran Pedagang Kuliner Dan Kesejahteraan Masyarakat." *IQTISHADIA Jurnal Ekonomi & Perbankan Syariah* 7, no. 2 (November 16, 2020): 138–55. <https://doi.org/10.19105/iqtishadia.v7i2.3522>.
- Mashuri, Ilham. "Implementation of Sharia Compliance in The Halal Tourism Industry In Indonesia (A Study on Sharia Hotels and Beaches)." *Prophetic Law Review* 2, no. 2 (December 28, 2020): 200–220. <https://doi.org/10.20885/PLR.vol2.iss2.art5>.
- Maturbongs, Edoardus E., and Ransta L. Lekatompessy. "Kolaborasi Pentahelix Dalam Pengembangan Pariwisata Berbasis Kearifan Lokal Di Kabupaten Merauke."

Transparansi: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Administrasi 3, no. 1 (June 30, 2020): 55–63.
<https://doi.org/10.31334/transparansi.v3i1.866>.

Mufli, Muhammad. "East Java Halal Tourism Outlook: Potential Analysis and Strategy for East Java Halal Tourism Development." *East Java Economic Journal* 2, no. 2 (August 5, 2018): 187–209. <https://doi.org/10.53572/ejavec.v2i2.19>.

Mulyani, Sri, Retno Dewi Pramodia Ahsani, and Daya Negri Wijaya. "Collaborative Governance on Ecotourism: Towards Sustainable Tourism Development." *Jurnal Borneo Administrator* 17, no. 3 (December 28, 2021): 319–34. <https://doi.org/10.24258/jba.v17i3.958>.

Muntholib, Abdul. "Strategi Pengelolaan Wisata Halal pada Pondok Pesantren." *Jihbiz: Journal of Islamic Economy, Finance, and Banking* 4, no. 1 (January 25, 2020): 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.33379/jihbiz.v4i1.840>.

Nainggolan, Mangido, I. Wayan Ardika, I. Ketut Ardhana, and I. Ketut Setiawan. "Pentahelix Model Application for Tourism Development Strategy." *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Culture* 6, no. 2 (March 2, 2020): 12–18. <https://doi.org/10.21744/ijllc.v6n2.864>.

Novianti, Khusnul Rofida. "Maximizing Bali Village Tourism Potential Using Penta-Helix Model." *International Journal of Social Science and Business* 5, no. 1 (March 15, 2021): 86–92. <https://doi.org/10.23887/ijssb.v5i1.30650>.

Putri, Diva Lufiana. "Indonesia Peringkat Kedua Wisata Halal Dunia 2022." KOMPAS.com, July 18, 2022. <https://www.kompas.com/tren/read/2022/07/18/093100565/indonesia-peringkat-kedua-wisata-halal-dunia-2022>.

Putro, Heru Purboyo Hidayat, and Astri Briliayanti. "The Effectivity of Stakeholders' Collaboration on Tourism Destination Governance in Pangandaran, West Java, Indonesia." *ASEAN Journal on Hospitality and Tourism* 17, no. 1 (June 15, 2019): 25–37. <https://doi.org/10.5614/ajht.2019.17.1.3>.

Qodriyatun, Sri Nurhayati. "Implementasi Kebijakan Pengembangan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan di Karimunjawa." *Aspirasi: Jurnal Masalah-masalah Sosial* 9, no. 2 (March 26, 2019): 240–59. <https://doi.org/10.46807/aspirasi.v9i2.1110>.

Rahardjo, M. Dawam. *Pembangunan Pascamodernis: Esai-Esai Politik*. Yogyakarta: Insist Press, 2012.

Ramadhani, Marina. "Dilema Regulasi Pariwisata Halal Di Indonesia." *Ar Rehla: Journal of Islamic Tourism, Halal Food, Islamic Traveling, and Creative Economy* 1, no. 1 (April 27, 2021): 89–105. <https://doi.org/10.21274/ar-rehla.2021.1.1.89-105>.

Redaksi. "Kongres Halal Internasional 2022 Cetuskan 9 Butir Resolusi Halal Dunia." *Majelis Ulama Indonesia* (blog), June 16, 2022. <https://mui.or.id/berita/35833/kongres-halal-internasional-2022-cetuskan-9-butir-resolusi-halal-dunia/>.

- . “Wisata Halal, ‘Vaksin’ Pariwisata Di Masa Pandemi Covid-19,” Desember 2020. <https://diskominfotik.ntbprov.go.id/>.
- Redaksi HAI. “Prinsip Wisata Halal Sejalan Dengan Megatren Wisata Global,” Desember 2020. <https://www.harianaceh.co.id/>.
- Rifa’i, Mochamad Novi. “Integrasi Pariwisata Halal Di Kota Malang.” *Falah: Jurnal Ekonomi Syariah* 4, no. 2 (2019): 194–201.
- Santoso, Lukman, and Yutisa Tri Cahyani. “Pengaturan Wisata Halal Untuk Pembangunan Daerah: Transformasi Industri Halal Di Era Disrupsi.” *Supremasi Hukum: Jurnal Kajian Ilmu Hukum* 9, no. 1 (July 9, 2020): 57–75.
- Santoso, Lukman, Yutisa Tri Cahyani, and Suryani Suryani. “Dilema Kebijakan Wisata Halal Di Pulau Lombok.” *Jurnal Sosiologi Reflektif* 15, no. 1 (November 9, 2020): 23–44. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jsr.v15i1.1968>.
- Santoso, Lukman, Agus Triyanta, and Jawahir Thontowi. “Halal Tourism Regulations in Indonesia: Trends and Dynamics in the Digital Era.” *Ijtihad: Jurnal Wacana Hukum Islam Dan Kemanusiaan* 22, no. 1 (August 1, 2022): 73–94. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijtihad.v22i1.73-94>.
- Santoso, R. Slamet, and Titik Djumiarti. “Collaborative Governance in Tourism Development at the Protected Area Sangiran Indonesia,” 351–55. Atlantis Press, 2020. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.201219.053>.
- Sofia, Hanni. “Pariwisata Diproyeksikan Jadi Penyumbang Devisa Terbesar,” April 20, 2020. <https://www.antaranews.com/berita/1114530/>.
- Stiglitz, Joseph E. *Making Globalization Work*. WW Norton & Company, 2007.
- Sutono, Anang, Shahrudin Tahir, Sumaryadi Sumaryadi, Andre Hernowo, and Wisnu Rahtomo. “The Implementation of Halal Tourism Ecosystem Model in Borobudur Temple as Tourism Area.” *Indonesian Journal of Halal Research (IJHAR)* 3, no. 1 (February 28, 2021): 13–20. <https://doi.org/10.15575/ijhar.v3i1.11119>.
- Sya, Ahman, Muhammad Zid, Asma Irma S, Anita Eka Putri Anita, and Revi Mainaki. “Pengelolaan Destinasi Pariwisata Berkelanjutan: Kasus Tanjung Lesung Provinsi Banten.” *Jurnal Geografi, Edukasi Dan Lingkungan (JGEL)* 5, no. 1 (January 29, 2021): 27–32. <https://doi.org/10.22236/jgel.v5i1.5311>.
- Tim Detik. “Bisakah RI Jadi Pusat Industri Halal Dunia 2024?,” Desember 2021. <https://finance.detik.com/berita-ekonomi-bisnis/d-5839955/bisakah-ri-jadi-pusat-industri-halal-dunia-2024>.

- Tou, Harne Julianti, Melinda Noer, and Sari Lenggogeni. "Pengembangan Desa Wisata Yang Berkearifan Lokal Sebagai Bentuk Pembangunan Pariwisata Berkelanjutan." *JURNAL REKAYASA* 10, no. 2 (December 10, 2020): 95–101. <https://doi.org/10.37037/jrftsp.v10i2.63>.
- Umiyati, Sri, and M. Husni Tamrin. *Pengembangan Wisata Halal, Tanggung Jawab Siapa? Studi Kasus Kolaborasi Stakeholder Halal Tourism Di Kota Malang*. Jakarta: Penerbit Akses, 2020.
- . "Penta Helix Synergy in Halal Tourism Development," 75–81. Atlantis Press, 2021. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.210120.108>.
- Wahida, Siti Nurul, Yana Syafriyana, and Oman Sukmana. "Collaboration with Pentahelix Model in Developing Kajoetangan Heritage Tourism in Malang City." *Journal of Local Government Issues (LOGOS)* 3, no. 1 (March 30, 2020): 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.22219/logos.v3i1.10699>.
- Yuningsih, Tri, Titi Darmi, and Susi Sulandari. "Model Pentahelik Dalam Pengembangan Pariwisata Di Kota Semarang." *JPSI (Journal of Public Sector Innovations)* 3, no. 2 (May 31, 2019): 84–93. <https://doi.org/10.26740/jpsi.v3n2.p84-93>.